## OFFICE OF THE ELECTION SUPERVISOR for the INTERNATIONAL BROTHERHOOD OF TEAMSTERS

## IN RE: HOFFA-HALL 2016,

Protestor.

Protest Decision 2015 ESD 31 Issued: August 30, 2015 OES Case No. P-036-081815-ME

Hoffa-Hall 2016 filed a pre-election protest pursuant to Article XIII, Section 2(b) of the Rules for the 2015-2016 IBT International Union Delegate and Officer Election ("*Rules*"). The protest alleged that supporters of Teamsters United violated the *Rules* by affixing campaign stickers to union and public utility property.

Election Supervisor representative Dan Walsh investigated this protest.

)

)

## **Findings of Fact and Analysis**

On August 17, 2015, three men were observed posting "pole" stickers (bumper stickers intended for posting on a vertical surface such as a fence post or utility pole rather than a horizontal surface such as a car bumper) on posts and poles in the immediate vicinity of the Local Union 20 hall on South Hawley Street in Toledo, OH. The stickers they posted advocated support for Tim Sylvester, candidate for IBT General President on the Teamsters United slate:



The stickers were affixed to public utility poles and to fence posts. Thus, one sticker was posted on a wooden pole that suspended electrical wires and also held a speed limit sign. Another was posted on a metal pole that supported a street lamp.

In addition to these, several were affixed to posts that supported the chain link fencing around Local Union 20's parking lot. Pole stickers were on the posts that formed the gate to that lot as well as on a corner post that faced the street. On instruction from our investigator, the stickers affixed to the union fencing were removed on August 19 by the local union's custodian.

## *Hoffa-Hall 2016*, 2015 ESD 31 August 30, 2015

Teamsters United sells the Sylvester stickers to Teamster members and retirees on its website. One witness observed the men who posted the stickers. According to that witness, the men wore blue Teamsters United t-shirts. Our investigation did not reveal the identity of the men.

The *Rules* prohibit posting of campaign stickers on union property. <u>Black</u>, 2001 ESD 338 (May 1, 2001). Use of union fixtures for a campaign display also violates the provision of Article VII, Section 12(c) barring use of "Union ... facilities ... to assist in campaigning." Further, display of the stickers on local property violates Article XI, Section 1(a)(3), which prohibits a candidate from receiving campaign assistance from a union. In addition, the *Rules* protect the right of members not to be involved in union politics if that is their decision, and use of the local hall or other union-owned fixtures to display one side's campaign materials interferes with the rights under Article VII, Section 12(a) of all members of that local union who disagree or wish to remain uninvolved. Finally, affixing difficult-to-remove adhesive stickers to smooth surfaces such as metal fence posts constitutes vandalism. *Willett*, P863 (August 16, 1996).

With respect to the posting of stickers on public utility poles, the *Rules* neither protect nor prohibit this activity. *Black, supra*; see also *Meadows*, P877 (August 27,1996), citing *Braga*, P795 (June 19, 1996). As such, individuals do not have a right under the *Rules* to affix campaign stickers to such objects. Equally, individuals who remove or deface campaign stickers posted on such objects do not violate the *Rules*.

Accordingly, we GRANT the protest as it relates to the stickers posted on union property and DENY it in all other respects.

## **Remedy**

When the Election Supervisor determines that the *Rules* have been violated, he "may take whatever remedial action is deemed appropriate." Article XIII, Section 4. In fashioning the appropriate remedy, the Election Supervisor views the nature and seriousness of the violation as well as its potential for interfering with the election process. "The Election Supervisor's discretion in fashioning an appropriate remedy is broad and is entitled to deference." *Hailstone & Martinez*, 10 EAM 7 (September 14, 2010).

We direct Teamsters United to take appropriate steps to insure that its supporters do not use union facilities to post campaign material in violation of the *Rules*. <u>Leedham Slate</u>, 2006 ESD 301 (July 5, 2006).

Any interested party not satisfied with this determination may request a hearing before the Election Appeals Master within two (2) working days of receipt of this decision. The parties are reminded that, absent extraordinary circumstances, no party may rely upon evidence that was not presented to the Office of the Election Supervisor in any such appeal. Requests for a hearing shall be made in writing, shall specify the basis for the appeal, and shall be served upon:

Kathleen A. Roberts Election Appeals Master JAMS

# 620 Eighth Avenue, 34<sup>th</sup> floor New York, NY 10018 kroberts@jamsadr.com

Copies of the request for hearing must be served upon the parties, as well as upon the Election Supervisor for the International Brotherhood of Teamsters, 1050 17<sup>th</sup> Street, N.W., Suite 375, Washington, D.C. 20036, all within the time prescribed above. A copy of the protest must accompany the request for hearing.

Richard W. Mark Election Supervisor

cc: Kathleen A. Roberts 2015 ESD 31

## *Hoffa-Hall 2016*, 2015 ESD 31 August 30, 2015

#### **DISTRIBUTION LIST (BY EMAIL UNLESS OTHERWISE SPECIFIED):**

Bradley T. Raymond, General Counsel International Brotherhood of Teamsters 25 Louisiana Avenue, NW Washington, DC 20001 braymond@teamster.org

David J. Hoffa 1701 K Street NW, Ste 350 Washington DC 20036 hoffadav@hotmail.com

Ken Paff Teamsters for a Democratic Union P.O. Box 10128 Detroit, MI 48210-0128 ken@tdu.org

Barbara Harvey 1394 E. Jefferson Avenue Detroit, MI 48207 blmharvey@sbcglobal.net

Teamsters United 315 Flatbush Avenue, #501 Brooklyn, NY 11217 info@teamstersunited.org

Louie Nikolaidis 350 West 31<sup>st</sup> Street, Suite 40 New York, NY 10001 Inikolaidis@lcnlaw.com

Julian Gonzalez 350 West 31<sup>st</sup> Street, Suite 40 New York, NY 10001 jgonzalez@lcnlaw.com

David O'Brien Suetholz 515 Park Avenue Louisville, KY 45202 dave@unionsidelawyers.com

Fred Zuckerman P.O. Box 9493 Louisville, KY 40209 fredzuckerman@aol.com Teamsters Local Union 20 435 S Hawley Street Toledo, OH 43609 blteamsters@aol.com corkeyteamsters@aol.com

Dan Walsh 950 Duxbury Court, Cincinnati, OH 45255 djw4947@gmail.com

John Pegula 1434 Greendale Dr. Pittsburgh, PA 15239 jpegula@ibtvote.org

Jeffrey Ellison 214 S. Main Street, Suite 210 Ann Arbor, MI 48104 EllisonEsq@aol.com